



COMMUNITY HERITAGE COMMISSION

Wednesday, March 3, 2021

Meeting held electronically under Ministerial Order No. M192/2020 and the current Order of the Provincial Health Officer - *Gatherings and Events*

MINUTES

VOTING MEMBERS PRESENT:

- | | |
|--------------------------|--------------------------------------|
| Councillor Jaimie McEvoy | - Chair |
| Maureen Arvanitidis | - Community Member |
| Samuel Boisvert | - Community Member |
| John Davies | - Community Member |
| Rosanne Hood | - NWHPS Representative |
| Lindsay Macintosh | - Community Member |
| Robert Petrusa | - Community Member |
| David Sarraf | - Community Member (arrived at 6:30) |

GUESTS:

- | | |
|----------------|-----------------------------|
| Robert Billard | - Billard Architecture Inc. |
|----------------|-----------------------------|

STAFF:

- | | |
|------------------|----------------------------------------|
| Karen Campbell | - Planner |
| Britney Dack | - Heritage Planner |
| Rob McCullough | - Manager, Museums & Heritage Services |
| Kathleen Stevens | - Heritage Planning Analyst |
| Carilyn Cook | - Committee Clerk |
| Heather Corbett | - Committee Clerk |

The meeting was called to order at 6:03 p.m.

1.0 ADDITIONS TO AGENDA

No additions or revisions were made.

2.0 ADOPTION OF MINUTES

2.1 Adoption of the Minutes of December 2, 2020

MOVED and SECONDED

THAT the minutes of the December 2, 2020 Community Heritage Commission meeting be adopted as circulated.

CARRIED.

All members present voted in favour of the motion.

3.0 PRESENTATIONS

None.

4.0 UNFINISHED BUSINESS

None.

5.0 NEW BUSINESS

5.1 Alternate Chair

MOVED and SECONDED

THAT John Davies be appointed as the Alternate Chair of the Community Heritage Commission for the 2021/2022 term.

CARRIED.

All members of the Panel present voted in favour of the motion.

5.2 800 Columbia Street (CPR Station): Free Standing Patio Addition

Karen Campbell, Planner, reviewed the staff report dated March 3, 2021, regarding an application to build a free-standing patio structure at 800 Columbia Street, and requested the Commission provide feedback on how successful the proposed design is at achieving the “Standards and Guidelines for the Conservation of Historic Places in Canada” (S&Gs) objectives of additions being respectful, subordinate, distinguishable, and compatible to the heritage building.

In response to questions from the Commission, Ms. Campbell and Robert Billard, Billard Architecture, provided the following information:

- Concrete footings for each of the columns would be installed as part of the structure to ensure that it remains secured in place;
- The capacity of the patio is not increasing in size and would remain as permitted in the liquor license;
- The roof of the structure would not touch the existing CPR building, but does cantilever towards the kitchen door to provide cover for the servers;

- The slope and underside of the ceiling is as low as possible, while still ensuring sufficient drainage; and,
- The glass has been tinted in the rendering in order to show the glass; however, it would be clear and possible to see through the structure in situ.

Mr. Billard provided some detail about the inspiration and intent of the structure, noting that the main focus is intended to be on the repeated frame that can be seen when travelling past the patio in a skytrain or a car. The intention is that there is a different view of the patio every time it is observed. The patio structure has been designed to act as a transition to the modern, linear forms in the area, such as the Anvil Centre and the Wait for me Daddy sculpture, and is not meant to be a reproduction of a particular train station or to have curves or organic forms.

In discussion, Commission members noted the following comments:

- The design appears compatible with the S&G and was generally supported;
- It may be appropriate for the new structure to be pulled back towards the left so that it does not interfere with sight lines of the CPR Building;
- Concerns were expressed that the CPR building may be obscured depending on where it is being viewed from;
- Concerns were expressed that the design of the patio structure is not compatible with the design of the CPR Station, and could incorporate curves and vaults, such as the Pioneer Square pergola in Seattle, which is interesting to view on its own;
- The structure may be better situated at the other end of the CPR Station, facing West.

MOVED and SECONDED

THAT the Community Heritage Commission support the application for the free standing patio addition at 800 Columbia Street (CPR Station).

CARRIED.

John Davies voted in opposition.

5.3 209 Second Street: Heritage Alteration Permit – to Allow the Demolition of a 1940 Building in the Queen’s Park Heritage Conservation Area (HCA)

Kathleen Stevens, Heritage Planning Analyst, reviewed the staff memorandum dated March 3, 2021 in regards to a house at 209 Second Street, noting that the heritage assessment submitted and staff review did not warrant its retention, and the demolition permit has been issued.

In response to questions from the Commission, Ms. Stevens and Britney Dack, Heritage Planner, provided the following information:

- The Minutes of the September 2, 2020 CHC meeting were incorrect in stating that the house at 209 Second Street is not protected under the Queen’s Park Heritage Conservation Area (HCA);

- The current City process is that Heritage Alteration Permits (HAPs) are not reviewed by the Community Heritage Commission (CHC) prior to the Director of Development Services issuing a demolition permit;
- The CHC is not required to review HAPs, as the Commission's work focuses on reviewing designations, conservation work, Heritage Revitalization Agreements, heritage advocacy, and more;
- Under the HCA, there are three ways a demolition may be permitted:
 1. If a house is not protected, a demolition permit would be permitted;
 2. If a house is protected (1940 or earlier), an owner can apply for a HAP for demolition, and the decision is delegated to the Director of Development Services;
 3. If a house is protected, an owner can apply for an Official Community Plan (OCP) Amendment to change the protection, and this would be reviewed by Council;
- As no community consultation is required, the Queen's Park Resident's Association (QPRA) is not informed of a potential demolition;
- When a HAP application is received, it is reviewed against both the existing evaluation criteria and the more recently drafted evaluation criteria;
- When a house is protected under the Queen's Park HCA, it means that any proposed demolition requires a review and permits, and the City has the authority to say no;
- Despite scoring low on the evaluation checklist, this property was included in the HCA protection because the building permit was issued in December 1940; and,
- Because this property was on the cusp of protection, it has gone through additional levels of review before going to the Director of Development Services. The Applicant had a professional heritage review of the property completed, and a staff review using both the original HCA evaluation tool and the revised criteria was completed.

The Commission made the following comments:

- Protected properties should merit some review or opportunity for comment from the community prior to a demolition permit being issued;
- With the loss of 209 Second Street, perhaps a reference to the property could be added to the Statement of Significance (SOS) of the similarly styled houses at 122 and 126 Queens Ave, to acknowledge their rarity; and,
- The demolition of this house changes the streetscape of the HCA.

The Chair suggested that an orientation about the HAP process, demolition policy and community notification policy within the Queen's Park Heritage Conservation Area, including a document overviewing the policies, could be presented at the next CHC meeting.

5.4 1414 Tenth Ave: Demolition of a 1911 Building

Kathleen Stevens, Heritage Planning Analyst, reviewed the staff report dated March 3, 2021 in regards to an application to demolish the 1911 house at 1414 Tenth Avenue, noting that while the building has minimal heritage significance, the application has been brought to the Commission because of the building's age. Ms. Stevens noted that staff support the demolition permit and asked the Commission for feedback.

In response to a question from the Commission, Ms. Stevens noted that the building has been altered significantly from its original state, which lowers its heritage value.

The Commission commented that the house is illegible as a 100+ year old building other than the brackets and gables, and there does not seem to be merit in its retention.

MOVED and SECONDED

That the Community Heritage Commission recommend the Director of Development Services issue the Demolition Permit for 1414 Tenth Avenue.

CARRIED.

All members present voted in favour of the motion.

6.0 REPORTS AND INFORMATION

6.1 General Inquiries from the Commission

1. Temporary Use Permit at 723 Fourth Street

The Commission inquired about the outcome of their December 2, 2020 recommendation for Council to issue a Temporary Use Permit (TUP) for the house at 723 Fourth Street.

Kathleen Stevens, Heritage Planning Analyst, noted that staff had been working with the property owner, and had sent a report to the Land Use and Planning Committee (LUPC) to provide the LUPC with the CHC's recommendation for retention, as well as information about the owners disinterest in pursuing a Heritage Revitalization Agreement (HRA) for the property. At the LUPC meeting, a motion was passed to recommend demolition given that the applicant had shown no interest in retention; however, subsequent to the LUPC meeting, the applicant has shown interest in retention, therefore more developments may still ensue with this file.

2. 1111 Dublin Street

In response to a question from the Commission, Ms. Stevens noted that when an application to demolish any building over 50 years old is received, a heritage review is completed. In the case of 1111 Dublin Street, a letter was sent to the applicant encouraging retention through an HRA, and providing information on alternatives to demolition including deconstruction and relocation; however the owners were not interested and have not chosen any of these options.

3. It was noted that W.S. Maxwell, who was the architect of the New Westminster CP Rail station, designed the New Westminster station after the Vancouver rail station of a similar style was demolished by fire.

6.2 Demolition Permit Applications Issued November 24, 2020 to February 19, 2021:

ADDRESS	YEAR BUILT	NEIGHBOURHOOD
341 JOHNSTON ST	1947	QUEENSBOROUGH
30 ROYAL AVE*	1948	DOWNTOWN
37 WELLINGTON ST*	1891	DOWNTOWN
38 DUFFERIN ST*	1889	DOWNTOWN
55 DUFFERIN ST*	1912	DOWNTOWN
1816 NANAIMO ST	1945	WESTEND
330 E COLUMBIA ST (RCH site)	1961	SAPPERTON
2116 DUBLIN ST	1940	CONNAUGHT HEIGHTS
209 E COLUMBIA ST	1943	SAPPERTON
1111 DUBLIN ST	1933	KELVIN
307 SEVENTH AVE	1912	GLENBROOKE NORTH
2121 DUBLIN ST	1941	CONNAUGHT HEIGHTS
45 E EIGHTH AVE	1968	VICTORY HEIGHTS
1815 EDINBURGH ST	1940	WESTEND
1321 CARIBOO ST (destroyed by fire)	1956	BROW OF THE HILL

***demolition by Province as part of Pattullo Bridge replacement project**

In response to questions from the Commission, Britney Dack, Heritage Planner, provided the following information:

- Four addresses in the above table refer to houses that were located at the entrance of the new Patullo Bridge;
- The Province has full jurisdiction over the area, so the City cannot require any action; however, Development Services did request that the Province apply for a demolition permit so that the houses could be documented for the City's archives before being demolished; and,
- There was an attempt to sell the houses for re-location; however it was not possible within the Province's timelines.

7.0 CORRESPONDENCE

None.

8.0 NEXT MEETING

8.1 Next Meeting Date: Wednesday, April 7, 2021 (held electronically under Ministerial Order No. M192/2020) or at the call of the Chair

9.0 ADJOURNMENT

ON MOTION, the meeting was adjourned at 7:08 p.m.

Certified correct,

ORIGINAL SIGNED
Councillor Jaimie McEvoy
Chair

ORIGINAL SIGNED
Heather Corbett
Committee Clerk