



COMMUNITY HERITAGE COMMISSION

Wednesday, May 5, 2021

Meeting held electronically under Ministerial Order No. M192/2020 and the current Order of the Provincial Health Officer - *Gatherings and Events*

MINUTES

VOTING MEMBERS PRESENT:

- Councillor Jaimie McEvoy - Chair
- Maureen Arvanitidis - Community Member
- Samuel Boisvert - Community Member
- John Davies - Community Member, Alternate Chair
- Rosanne Hood - NWHPS Representative
- Lindsay Macintosh - Community Member

VOTING MEMBERS REGRETS:

- Robert Petrusa - Community Member
- David Sarraf - Community Member

GUESTS:

- Katie Cumber - Heritage Consultant
- Joyce Donovan - Applicant, 515 St. George Street
- Gillian Jamieson - Applicant, 208 Fifth Avenue
- Marko Majkic - Applicant, 219 Second Street
- Kirsten Sutton - D3 Design

STAFF:

- Britney Dack - Senior Heritage Planner
- Rob McCullough - Manager, Museums & Heritage Services
- Kathleen Stevens - Heritage Planning Analyst
- Janet Zazubek - Planner
- Heather Corbett - Committee Clerk

The meeting was called to order at 6:00 p.m.

1.0 EXCLUSION OF THE PUBLIC

MOVED and SECONDED

THAT pursuant to Section 90 of the Community Charter, members of the public be excluded from the Closed Meeting of the Community Heritage Commission immediately following the Regular Meeting of the Community Heritage Commission on the basis that the subject matter of all agenda items to be considered relate to

matters listed under Sections 90(1)(k) of the Community Charter:

(k) negotiations and related discussions respecting the proposed provision of a municipal service that are at their preliminary stages and that, in the view of the Commission, could reasonably be expected to harm the interests of the municipality if they were held in public;

CARRIED.

All Commission members present voted in favour of the motion.

2.0 ADJOURNMENT

MOVED and SECONDED

THAT the Community Heritage Commission adjourn the meeting in open session and proceed to Closed Session.

CARRIED.

All Commission members present voted in favour of the motion.

3.0 RECONVENE TO REGULAR MEETING

At 6:37 p.m., the Commission passed the following motion:

MOVED and SECONDED

THAT the Community Heritage Commission reconvene in open session.

CARRIED.

All Commission members present voted in favour of the motion.

4.0 ADDITIONS TO AGENDA

No changes or additions.

5.0 ADOPTION OF MINUTES

5.1 Adoption of the Minutes of April 7, 2021

MOVED and SECONDED

THAT the minutes of the April 7, 2021 Community Heritage Commission meeting be adopted as circulated.

CARRIED.

All Commission members present voted in favour of the motion.

6.0 UNFINISHED BUSINESS

None.

7.1 515 St. George Street: Heritage Revitalization Agreement & Applicant Presentation

Janet Zazubek, Planner, reviewed the May 5, 2021 staff report regarding an application for a Heritage Revitalization Agreement (HRA) to allow a two-storey infill house in exchange for protecting the 1912 house at 515 St. George Street, which is currently on the City's Heritage Register and in the Queen's Park Heritage Conservation Area.

Ms. Zazubek requested that the Commission provide feedback on the heritage value and proposed conservation work on the heritage house, the design relationship of the proposed laneway house to the heritage house, and provide a recommendation to Council of support or non-support on the HRA.

Kirsten Sutton, D3 Design, Katie Cummer, Heritage Consultant, and Joyce Donovan, Applicant, provided a PowerPoint presentation highlighting the details of the project, including:

- Goals and background of the project, including the history and significance of the heritage house and its character-defining elements, and,
- Rehabilitation details for the heritage house and design of the infill house, which is designed to be subordinate to and distinguishable from the heritage house.

In response to questions from the Commission, Ms. Sutton, Ms. Cummer, and Ms. Zazubek provided the following information:

- The current zoning of the property is RS-6, which does not allow for laneway houses;
- The HRA would allow the property to align with the rest of the neighbourhood, which allows for laneway houses;
- The orientation and access to the infill house would be off of Lancaster Street, which would provide activation to the street;
- The standard laneway program requirement would be two parking spaces; however, due to the property's narrow width, the applicants have requested a relaxation to one parking space and the off-site spot has been designed to be deep enough for two cars parked in tandem;
- There is currently only one dedicated parking space for the heritage house and suite;
- The notation on the drawings which labels the heritage house as a duplex is a typo, and it should have indicated the principal dwelling with a suite;
- The distance between the existing house and laneway house would be 24.5 feet (7.46 meters) ;

- A low amount of restoration work is proposed on the heritage house as it has been well-maintained since the house was moved and previous restoration work was completed; and,
- The HRA process would make maintenance of the features of the heritage house prescriptive, even if a new owner comes in.

In discussion, Commission members noted appreciation for the proposal and the preservation of the heritage house.

MOVED and SECONDED

That the Community Heritage Commission recommend that Council support the Heritage Revitalization Agreement for 515 St. George Street.

CARRIED.

Rosanne Hood voted in opposition to the motion.

7.2 208 Fifth Avenue: Heritage Revitalization Agreement & Applicant Presentation

Kathleen Stevens, Heritage Planning Analyst, reviewed the May 5, 2021 staff report regarding a proposed Heritage Revitalization Agreement (HRA) at 208 Fifth Avenue to subdivide the property into two lots, retain, protect and move the existing house forward onto the northerly lot fronting Fifth Avenue, as well as build a new house on the southerly lot fronting Elgin Street, which is designed to be reflective of the area’s traditional character.

Ms. Stevens requested the Commission provide feedback on the heritage value and proposed conservation work on the heritage house, the design relationship of the proposed new house to the heritage house, and provide a recommendation to Council of support or non-support on the HRA.

Kirsten Sutton, D3 Design, Katie Cummer, Heritage Consultant, and Gillian Jamieson, Applicant, provided a PowerPoint presentation in regards to the project, highlighting the following information:

- Goals and background of the project, including the history and significance of the heritage house and its character-defining elements, and,
- Rehabilitation details of the heritage house, and design of the additional house fronting Elgin Street.

In response to questions from the Commission, Ms. Sutton, Ms. Cummer, Ms. Jamieson, Ms. Stevens, and Britney Dack, Senior Heritage Planner, provided the following information:

- The back dormer is existing on the house, and is proposed to be widened;
- The reason for moving the heritage house forward on the property is to accommodate the infill house, as it would be challenging to have both houses on the property in the current configuration;

- The neighbouring house to the east of the subject property is further forward on the property;
- Moving the heritage house would not impact either of the large trees on the property, and this has been confirmed by both private and City arborists who have investigated, and would be on site to monitor the project;
- Moving the house forward on the lot would be in compliance with the City's front setback requirements for the proposed lot size;
- Other than a few cracks, there are no particular issues with the foundation of the heritage house; however, moving the house forward would provide for a new foundation;
- Some of the relaxations being requested in the applications are for the carports and decks on both houses;
- The windows that are proposed to be removed would be used in other locations within the heritage house;
- A curb cut on Fifth Avenue would be required for the new carport to be located at the front of the property; and,
- Within the Queen's Park Heritage Conservation Area (HCA) guidelines, carports are listed in the acceptable category.

In discussion, the Commission made the following comments:

- The bellcast roof on the heritage house is indicative of the Arts and Crafts style, rather than Colonial Revival as indicated in the applicant's submission;
- Concern was expressed about moving the heritage house forward on the lot, as it would no longer line up with the neighbouring house which faces the same direction on the street, and it would change the streetscape;
- Concern was expressed about the use of the HRA, as it would be increasing the density on the lot and the house is already protected by the Queen's Park HCA;
- Moving the house on the lot within the front setback limits would be appropriate in order to accommodate the infill house;
- The dormer extension and new dormer would be favourable interventions on the heritage house;
- The carport does not appear to be a complimentary addition to the house;
- If the original windows were preserved and restored and the carport was revised, the application could be supportable;
- There appears to be some inconsistent information within the report; and,
- It may be useful for the Commission members to do a site visit for further observation and to aid in their recommendation.

MOVED and SECONDED

THAT the Community Heritage Commission recommend further discussion between the City and the applicant on the identified issues for 208 Fifth Avenue and return to the Commission for further review.

CARRIED.

Maureen Arvanitidis voted in opposition to the motion.

7.3 364 Keary Street: Demolition of a 1891 Building

Kathleen Stevens, Heritage Planning Analyst, reviewed the May 5, 2021 staff report regarding demolition of the 130 year old, two storey, gabled vernacular building at 364 Keary Street, noting that under the 100 Year and Older Heritage Review Policy, a Heritage Assessment and a review by the Community Heritage Commission is required. The building is not legally protected, nor listed on the City's Heritage Register or Inventory.

In discussion, the Commission made the following comments:

- Apart from scale, form and massing, there appears to be little remaining in terms of the structural integrity and heritage value of the house; and,
- It would be beneficial to see this house be deconstructed, and for the wood to be recycled.

MOVED and SECONDED

THAT the Community Heritage Commission recommend the Director of Development Services issue the Demolition Permit for 364 Keary Street, and that the applicant consider deconstruction as an alternative to demolition waste.

CARRIED.

All Commission members present voted in favour of the motion.

7.4 219 Second Street: Demolition of a 1941 Building

Kathleen Stevens, Heritage Planning Analyst, reviewed the May 5, 2021 staff report regarding a non-protected property at 219 Second Street, which is located within the Queen's Park Heritage Conservation Area; and is not listed on the City's Heritage Register. The house is over 50 years old, listed on the City's Heritage Resource Inventory, and retains many of its original features.

Ms. Stevens noted that the Community Heritage Commission was being asked to review the heritage value of this building in advance of the Director of Development Service's consideration of a demolition permit and to provide a recommendation.

In response to questions from the Commission, Ms. Stevens and Marko Majkic, Applicant, provided the following information:

- The property was acquired by the applicant 18 months ago and it is intended that a new house would be built on the lot to accommodate their family; and,
- The house is not currently protected within the Queen's Park HCA due to its year of construction.

In discussion, the Commission made the following comments:

- Construction of storybook-style houses during World War II was rare; therefore the house holds significance for the area;

- It is evident that repairing the foundation and doing other work to the house would be costly; and,
- As the house is of storybook-style, and has original features, such as the windows and chimney, it would be unfortunate to issue a demolition permit.

MOVED and SECONDED

THAT the Community Heritage Commission recommend that Council consider formal protection on 219 Second Street through a Heritage Designation Bylaw.

CARRIED.

All Commission members present voted in favour of the motion.

8.0 REPORTS AND INFORMATION

At this point in the meeting, the Community Heritage Commission members and City staff did a round of introductions.

8.1 Overview of Municipal Heritage Tools

The Commission postponed the presentation in Item 8.1 to the June 2, 2021 meeting.

8.2 General Inquiries from the Commission (Standing Item)

1. Additional Question about 219 Second Street (reviewed in Item 7.3)

In response to a question from the Commission, Britney Dack, Senior Heritage Planner, provided the following information:

- It has been very rare for the CHC to recommend protection of a non-protected house in the past; however, the CHC’s recommendations for Temporary Protection Orders on properties have previously resulted in successful HRA negotiations; and,
- The next step for the property at 219 Second Street would be to present the CHC’s recommendation to Council.

2. Windows at 202 Third Avenue

In response to questions from the Commission, Britney Dack, Senior Heritage Planner, provided the following information:

- An enforcement case has been opened on the house at 202 Third Avenue regarding the vinyl windows; however staff is not at liberty to discuss the situation;
- The City is aware of the vinyl windows, but is understanding of the desire for increased energy efficiency such interventions can provide;
- The designation of heritage protection is on title at the Land Registry, therefore, it should be clear to potential home buyers;

- The City receives many questions about the implications and requirements of owning and maintaining designated heritage houses, and there are handouts and guides available; however, sales are not actively tracked; and,
- Heritage Designation is also required to be disclosed in a Property Disclosure Sheet (PDS) at the time of a purchase or sale.

Commission members provided the following comments:

- The New Westminster Heritage Foundation (NWHF) is supposed to contact people who buy heritage houses through its outreach program;
- Window replacement would be eligible for subsidy through the NWHF; and,
- Realtors may not know or be aware of the PDS requirement, and owners should be responsible for obtaining the information.

3. Naming a Heritage House

In response to a question from the Commission, Britney Dack, Senior Heritage Planner, noted that the naming of a house often occurs as part of defining the Statement of Significance (SOS).

Commission members noted the following:

- The house at 208 Fifth Avenue (as discussed in Item 7.2) has been referred to as the Robert Lane House; however the first family who lived there was named Calbick, from 1910 to 1965;
- There is already a designated Calbick House in the City;
- Robert Lane also has a house in his name, at 320 Fourth Street; and,
- The SOS of the house notes that the house was named after Robert Lane because he was the architect, which provides some notoriety to the house.

8.3 Demolition Permit Applications Issued from March 25, 2021 to April 27, 2021

| ADDRESS | YEAR BUILT | NEIGHBOURHOOD |
|---------------------|------------|-------------------|
| 545 GARFIELD STREET | 1955 | SAPPERTON |
| 419 NINTH STREET | 1902 | BROW OF THE HILL |
| 1420 NANAIMO STREET | 1936 | WESTEND |
| 219 BLACKMAN STREET | 1933 | GLENBROOKE NORTH |
| 1024 LONDON STREET | 1922 | KELVIN |
| 810 SCOTT STREET | 1912 | VICTORY HEIGHTS |
| 2232 LONDON STREET | 1941 | CONNAUGHT HEIGHTS |

9.0 CORRESPONDENCE

None.

10.0 NEXT MEETING

10.1 Next Meeting Date: Wednesday, June 2, 2021 (held electronically under Ministerial Order No. M192/2020) or at the call of the Chair

11.0 ADJOURNMENT

ON MOTION, the meeting was adjourned at 8:23 p.m.

Certified correct,

ORIGINAL SIGNED

**Councillor Jaimie McEvoy
Chair**

ORIGINAL SIGNED

**Heather Corbett
Committee Clerk**